Reviewer's report

**Title:** Obesity survival paradox in pneumonia: a dose-response meta-analysis of prospective cohort studies

**Version:** 1  **Date:** 1 January 2014

**Reviewer:** thomas TJ marrie

**Reviewer's report:**

This is is a timely report that uses meta analysis to examine the obesity paradox in pneumonia.

Minor essential revisions

1. Abstract - "" .... conducted a dose response meta-analysis ..." this is confusing - yes a meta analysis was conducted but what is a a dose response meta analysis. i know what the authors mean - suggest this be reworded.

2. The study in ref 12 involves patients on peritoneal dialysis and as such it will include patients with health care associated pneumonia. Why did you include this study?

3. Figure 5 - would be useful to present this as percent mortality at the various BMI categories .

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Statistical review:** Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

no conflicts