Reviewer's report

Title: Hypersomnia and depressive symptoms: Methodological and clinical aspects

Version: 1 Date: 16 January 2013

Reviewer: Katherine Kaplan

Reviewer's report:

This manuscript is a welcome contribution to the literature on hypersomnia and depression, an underresearched and underrepresented area. The breadth of the review, which includes hypersomnias of central origin, integrates a wide literature. I recommend acceptance of the manuscript pending consideration of the following.

Major Compulsory Revisions

1. The parallels between hypersomnia in depressive disorders and insomnia in depressive disorders are considerable. PSG evidence for insomnia often does not match self-report, paralleling PSG studies of hypersomnia in mood disorders, and yet insomnia is considered an independent disorder meriting treatment. It is possible that, even if hypersomnia is only a “subjective sleep complaint,” it has the same societal burden (Jenum & Kjellberg, 2010) and merits the same clinical attention as it would if objective evidence were observed. This should be discussed somewhere in the manuscript.

2. There are two separate “definitions” sections that describe hypersomnia, one on page 5 and another on page 9. It would help the flow of the paper to combine these definition sections.

Minor Essential Revisions

1. Page 4, parag 2: “major depression disorder” should be changed to “major depressive disorder.” Also, this term is again defined on page 5, parag 3.

2. Page 4, parag 2: add “the” before “result being unchanged.”

3. Page 10, parag 3: reference 43 may not be correctly placed.

4. Page 13, parag 2: “Another case-conrol study found mood disorder symptoms in one-third of narcolepsy patients, but with similar frequency of formal mood disorder diagnoses.” – Was the frequency one-third, or the frequency was similar to mood disorder diagnoses in the general population? Also, add ‘an’ to the following: “and 35% had AN anxiety disorder”.

Discretionary Revisions

1. Page 8, bottom of parag 1: The authors may wish to support their assertions on the inadequacy of self-report questionnaires with references. The authors may also wish to add references to page 14 parag 1 beginning with the term “Globally.”
2. Page 16, parag 2: “Depressive symptoms were noted in 15 to 25%..” how does this rate compare with the general population?

3. The authors discuss differentiating EDS from fatigue on page 9. I am also curious about the relationship between EDS and long sleep/excessive sleep quantity. Despite the fact that the diagnostic nomenclatures define EDS by “long sleep” (DSM-IV) or “sleep drunkenness” (ICD-10), it is unclear if EDS and excessive sleep co-occur. Indeed, in the Ohayon et al. 2012 paper cited, a weak relationship between EDS and sleep duration was observed. Although we include “excessive sleep” and “excessive daytime sleepiness” in our understanding of hypersomnia, is it possible they might be separate phenomena?

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.