Reviewer's report

Title: The Effects of apoptosis vulnerability markers on the myocardium in depression after myocardial infarction

Version: 5 Date: 24 October 2012

Reviewer: Lucia Carboni

Reviewer's report:

Reading the revised manuscript, I appreciate that I was unable to explain my meaning when I requested the authors to define which criteria they followed to split animals into depressed and non-depressed groups based on the results in two behavioural tests, open field locomotor activity and sucrose preference. In order to give an example of what I meant as selection criteria, I made reference to a paper in a completely different experimental setting (the learned helplessness) in which selection criteria were reported. Now I see that in this revision authors still do not define the criteria they used, but they made a reference to the paper I suggested as an example. Apart from this, I think that the paper is now acceptable to be published in BMC Psychiatry. I think that the reference to the Mallei’s paper should be removed as non relevant, and that the cut-off values used to include an animal in the depression group should be reported. Nevertheless, I feel sorry to ask for an additional revision when possibly the inability to explain what I meant was my fault.