Reviewer's report

Title: Who uses emergency departments inappropriately and when? A national cross sectional study using a monitoring data system

Version: 1 Date: 29 October 2013

Reviewer: Linda McCaig

Reviewer's report:

This manuscript is well written and addresses the major issue of primary care treatable ED visits that contribute to crowding, a growing problem in many countries. The strength of the paper lies in the dataset used which is, in essence, a census of ED visits in England during a 1-year period. The conclusions are supported by the data.

Major Compulsory Revisions
None

Minor Essential Revisions
Why did the authors exclude visits where the patient “left before being treated” and “left having refused treatment” as it would seem that these visits (2 million) are likely to be IA?

Discretionary Revisions
The discussion could be shortened by not repeating many of the results.
Table 4 – The time periods are not mutually exclusive. The ending time for the first period should be 7:59.
Table 4 and Figure 2 - Different time measures were used, i.e., non-Military in Table 4 and Military in Figure 2. These should be consistent.

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.