Reviewer's report

Title: Construct-level predictive validity of educational attainment and intellectual aptitude tests in medical student selection: Meta-regression of six UK longitudinal studies

Version: 1 Date: 5 July 2013

Reviewer: Sam Leinster

Reviewer's report:

1 This is a timely and useful paper. The concept of construct-level predictive ability is important in identifying the true contribution of various modalities to selection. The methods and data are complex but well-presented and easy to follow.

2 I have reservations about the use of entry to the specialist register as a marker of achievement as I do not think that hospital medicine is necessarily the pinnacle of medical practice. The authors touch briefly on this but do not give as much weight to discussing it as they could.

3 Major Compulsory Revisions
   None

4 Minor Essential Revisions
   None

5 Discretionary Revisions
   I think it would temper criticisms that might be leveled at the paper if there was more discussion of the limitations of using MRCP and the specialist register as the markers of success in a medical career.

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:
   I declare that I have no competing interests