Reviewer’s report

Title: Systematic review and meta-analysis: influence of smoking cessation on incidence of pneumonia in HIV

Version: 2 Date: 10 April 2012

Reviewer: Nicola Petrosillo

Reviewer’s report:

The authors deal with an important issue: influence of smoking cessation on pneumonia in HIV infected individuals. They face the issue by using a systematic review and a meta-analysis. The result is that smoking cessation can prevent on third of pneumonia in HIV infected individuals, but not PJP.

Methods and data are relevant. Of course, findings derive from the published data, and some of them are not enough sound (i.e. case-control studies). However, the authors mention all the limitations above described.

Some concerns:
1. page 6, last 3 lines. Criteria for including studies in the analysis. Are there any studies without radiographic confirmation of pneumonia? If the reply is yes, how acceptable is to include them in the analysis?
2. page 9: in the studies included in the analysis, was the antiretroviral treatment considered as yes or not, or also its duration was considered?
3. Did the authors find any difference according to the geographical area of the studies?
4. In the reference list, some articles are mentioned more times.

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I received honorary fees as speaker for GSK, Gilead, Pfizer, MSD, Johnson & Johnson, Carefusion, Novartis, Sanofi Aventis, Janssen Cilag, Astellas, and as member of scientific board for Janssen Cilag, Carefusion, MSD, Pfizer.