Reviewer's report

Title: Surgical Options for the Young Patient with an Arthritic Knee

Version: 1 Date: 1 October 2012

Reviewer: GAUTAM SHETTY

Reviewer's report:

This article is a review on surgical options for the young patient with arthritic knees.

At the outset, it is not very clear why the authors are writing this article...what is the purpose and how it adds to the current body of scientific literature.

Background: They have dedicated almost 1 1/2 pages to non-surgical modes of treatment which I think was unnecessary and which could have been dealt with in a single paragraph. Their focus should have been on surgical treatment options in this select age group and how that has evolved in terms of options and indications.

In the manuscript, the authors have mainly discussed 4 options - osteotomy, UKA, arthroscopy and ACI/MACI...What about other options such as TKA, patellofemoral joint replacement, osteochondral grafting, etc.

My suggestion to the authors is to do a proper systematic review on all surgical options for arthritic knees in the under 55 yr old patient.

The readers would benefit in knowing which treatment option to deploy in what clinical situation and how effective are they based on a systematic review.

Unfortunately, the article in its current form is insufficient in scientific content to merit acceptance.

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I have no competing interests.