Reviewer's report

Title: Surgical Options for the Young Patient with an Arthritic Knee

Version: 1 Date: 24 September 2012

Reviewer: mark P figgie

Reviewer's report:

1. under Background- longer life expectancy has more to do with how long the prosthesis needs to last than it does with the age of the patient at surgery

2. p3 -analyzed, hyaluronic acid- spelling

3. p4-please comment on additional cost of HA products over steroid injections

4. p7- regarding outcome of osteotomy- please mention patello-femoral disease, timing of HTO, amount of correction

5. p8- please stress technical difficulties- including previous poorly placed incisions, removal of hardware, patellar tendon shortening, exposure

6. p10- most people would suggest that anything more than a 5 degree flexion contracture is a problem- also mention that tibial translocation is a contraindication- discuss weight limits

7. p10- please add section on activity after UKR as compared to HTO

8. p10 change "simple" to straight forward

9. p11- in discuss arthroscopy- add sentence about possibility of post-op insufficiency fracture

10. p11- add discussion about poor results for patello-femoral disease

11. authors do not mention patellofemoral replacement- section on this should be added including indications, results and limitations

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests