Reviewer’s report

Title: Cognitive training in community dwelling elderly can improve performance on assessments associated with independent living: a randomized controlled trial of multi vs single domain interventions

Version: 1 Date: 7 November 2011

Reviewer: Glenn Smith

Reviewer’s report:

This is important work and the investigative team has been thorough and thoughtful in the development of this study. However there are two major compulsory revisions key to this report.

1) Please explain the inconsistent results. For instance why single domain training outperformed multi-domain training on more than half of the 24 (3 time points X8 cognitive domains) post-training assessments.

Moreover explain why single domain training, which focused on reasoning, out performed multidomain in several cognitive domains but not in the reasoning domain. The abstract leads one to believe that the multicomponent training did better than single domain but the data does not support this.

2) Very few of the subjects completed all training sessions. There should be a post-hoc analysis of the impact on cognitive outcomes of number of training sessions completed.

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.