Reviewer's report

Title: Immunotherapy using slow-cycling tumor cells prolonged overall survival of tumor-bearing mice

Version: 16 Date: 3 September 2012

Reviewer: Yukai He

Reviewer's report:

In this work, the authors tested a novel idea that slow-cycling tumor cells may provide more relevant Ag to protect tumor relapse and generate more clinically relevant responses to control tumor growth. The idea is excellent and deserves a careful and well designed investigation, which could generate significant impact on tumor immunotherapy.

In this revised manuscript, the authors thoroughly addressed the reviewer's concerns and comments from previous reviewing. The revised manuscript is much improved and provides a very interesting and novel idea on designing tumor vaccines as an adjuvant therapy for malignant tumors, which should have great impact on the field of tumor immunotherapy.

I think the authors should provide the following statistical analysis on the data. They may simply forgot to mention them in the figure legends.

1. It would be more convincing if the authors can provide the statistical analysis for the data in table 1-3.
2. Fig.3B and Fig.4B. Apparently, the statistics is done, but it should be explained in the Figure legend (What do the “***” and “**” mean? <0.05 or <0.01?)
3. The same issue is in Fig.5B and 5C
4. Fig.6 and 7 require statistical analysis.

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

No conflict of interest