Reviewer's report

Title: National and Subnational mortality effects of metabolic risk factors and smoking in Iran: comparative risk assessment

Version: 1 Date: 17 May 2011

Reviewer: Juergen Rehm

Reviewer's report:

Major compulsory revisions
None.

Minor essential revisions

The data in the first paragraph on population should be referenced. Also, the proportion of people of older than 64 should be given to have some anchor on the demographic change described.

I would be interesting to see, how many deaths occurred in the age group 64+ where no exposure data was available, and thus had to be estimated from age trends and other countries.

The modelling of simultaneous impact of more than one risk factor should be elaborated on.

It would be interesting to see, who many uncertainty would be due to the various factors. The uncertainty seems overall low, especially since a) the risk relations were all imported from other countries, b) all ages 64+ had to be estimated, which surely accounted for sizable numbers. Thus, the specific assumptions of uncertainty analyses should be made available to the reader. This is especially important, as most CRAs struggle with level of uncertainty and various solutions are possible within the framework described.

The references should be checked again. By chance I discovered the following ref with full first names spelled out which is surely correct:

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable
Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

none