Reviewer’s report

Title: Burden of injuries in Iranian children in 2005

Version: 1 Date: 24 October 2009

Reviewer: NAGESH BORSE

Reviewer’s report:

Major Compulsory Revisions

1) Article is too long and has too many tables and figures. I suggest that the authors should insert all the analysis. Instead pick important findings and have them in article. e.g. Figure of comparison of Iran with other WHO region. Is it necessary? The article in current format reads like a surveillance report. Again I suggest that the authors only discuss important findings

2) Missing information - Can you add analysis by month to understand seasonality issue, SES and injury burden. I also suggest adding provincial/state level analysis for Iran instead of WHO region analysis

3) The authors did not discuss limitations of the study anywhere. I think since the burden is estimated with WHO estimation limitations of data need to be discussed. for ex. how sensitive is injury surveillance in Iran. How many injuries don’t get reported.

Minor Essential Revisions

1) Tables and figures show unintentional and intentional together. all the tables need to be sorted based alphabetical, burden or intention

2) Figure needs correct title. Figure 2 has rural urban and by gender

3) Abstract should have national fatal and nonfatal rate in the results

4) Figure 1 is misleading - we cannot compare unless you can show rate. Proportion is difficult to compare as mentioned in the conclusion (1st sentence)

5) Result B- This rate decreases 79 in .... Please rewrite this sentence

6) Please refrain from using word 'Accidents'

7) Please clarify if the Bam earthquake data was included in the analysis

8) 1200 children died due to intentional injury - is it because of underreporting? Can you compare with violence data from Iran

9) There were no hospitalization due to drowning in the country. Is it possible? Is this because of missing Data? or reporting issue? Please discuss
10) Please conduct regional analysis and present it instead of WHO region comparison

11) Use the word 'unintentional' instead of non-intentional

12) Result F6 - what is the difference between animal bites (32%) and being bitten by animal (8%)?

13) Result F7 - Please discuss why drowning is 4 times higher in Urban areas. The authors talk about natural bodies as a risk factor for drowning. Then it should be rural areas and not urban areas. Need better reasoning.

14) The authors need to discuss the issue of underreporting or poor surveillance for low burden in rural areas

15) Need to remove or rewrite sentences -

There is nothing wrong with children who get injured or die ..... 

16) Instead of table 6 - I suggest that the authors create a table to compare burden reported in ref 12 Shanechian et al, Ref 17 Akbari, Other government reports/sources to compare their results

17) Table 1 - Not sure if it is needed for burden of injury paper. If want to keep please compress into 3/4 categories - Infectious, Chronic and injuries

18) Figure 2 - need correct title and overlapping of bars is not necessary

19) Please have maximum 3 important tables and 4 figures

Discretionary Revisions

1) 95% of injuries are unintentional should you only focus on unintentional?

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Not suitable for publication unless extensively edited

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'