Reviewer’s report

Title: Impact of diabetes mellitus on life expectancy and health-adjusted life expectancy in Canada

Version: 2 Date: 28 October 2011

Reviewer: K.M. Venkat Narayan

Reviewer’s report:

I had the benefit of existing reviews and the authors’ responses to them. As such, I am focussing my comments on the additional issues:

Major Compulsory Revisions

1. The authors should discuss their findings in light of other papers on the topic estimating impact of diabetes on life expectancy, and also place their results in broader context. In the recent issue of Diabetes Care Cunningham SA et al published a paper on diabetes-free life expectancy, and they also reference other previous papers. The authors need to study this and improve their introduction, methods, and discussion accordingly.

2. A few important sensitivity analysis will be helpful. The authors need to address the assumptions around which there is uncertainty. For example, the assumption of normality of life expectancy and HALE need to be subjected to sensitivity analysis. Similarly, the relative mortality rates (between those with and without diabetes) may also be subjected to sensitivity analysis.

3. Some attempt at "validation" by discussing how their results compared to those observed from other data or studies will be useful.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests