Reviewer's report

Title: A comparison of mental health policy in four African countries

Version: 1 Date: 1 October 2010

Reviewer: Hamada Hamid

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions

While I commend the authors for their important work in the field, this manuscript does not provide a significant, contribution to the literature.

1. Is the question posed by the authors new and well defined?
   No. This type of policy analysis has been done in the past by Omar et al. (see below reference. While the “Areas for Action” identified are important, they are fairly generic and already well described in other published articles as well as WHO documentation.

2. Are the methods appropriate and well described, and are sufficient details provided to replicate the work?
   No. The methods described were very subjective and depended on stakeholder opinions. There

3. Are the data sound and well controlled?
   Very little data was actually presented

4. Does the manuscript adhere to the relevant standards for reporting and data deposition?
   N/A

5. Are the discussion and conclusions well balanced and adequately supported by the data?
   As above

6. Do the title and abstract accurately convey what has been found?
   No. The fours African countries should have been named and the paper should have tried to distinguish itself form the Omar et al paper.

7. Is the writing acceptable?
   The writing was reasonable

Mental health policy process: a comparative study of Ghana, South Africa, Uganda and Zambia
Maye A Omar1*, Andrew T Green1*, Philippa K Bird1*, Tolib Mirzoev1*, Alan J Flisher2, Fred Kigozi3, Crick Lund2*, Jason Mwanza4 and Angela L Ofori-Atta5 for Mental Health and Poverty Research Programme Consortium (MHaPP)

An overview of Uganda's mental health care system: results from an assessment using the world health organization's assessment instrument for mental health systems (WHO-AIMS)

Fred Kigozi, Joshua Ssebunnya, Dorothy Kizza, Sara Cooper, Sheila Ndyanabangi and the Mental Health and Poverty Project International Journal of Mental Health Systems 2010,

Mapping mental health finances in Ghana, Uganda, Sri Lanka, India and Lao PDR

Shoba Raja1, Sarah K Wood1, Victoria de Menil2 and Saju C Mannarath1
1 Policy and Practice Directorate, BasicNeeds, 114, 4th Cross, OMBR Layout, Banaswadi, Bangalore, India
2 BasicNeeds, 158 A Parade, Leamington Spa, Warwickshire, UK

Mental health policy process: a comparative study of Ghana, South Africa, Uganda and Zambia Maye A Omar, #1 Andrew T Green,#1 Philippa K Bird,#1 Tolib Mirzoev,#1 Alan J Flisher,2 Fred Kigozi,3 Crick Lund,#2 Jason Mwanza,4 and Angela L Ofori-Atta5, Mental Health and Poverty Research Programme Consortium (MHaPP)

MHaPP Policy Brief Key elements of a situational analyses to inform mental health policy

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests