Reviewer's report

Title: Educating the Power: HIV Policy and Parliamentarians of Pakistan

Version: 2  Date: 4 August 2009

Reviewer: Gregory Pappas

Reviewer's report:

The piece is much better. I reads like a news item. That works if the journal uses that format.

The authors persist in some clearly mistaken opinions. First they say that the epidemic is not serious. I don’t have text in front of me. This is ridiculous as Pakistan less then two years ago went from a low level to a concentrated epidemic. This is catastrophic and should have been avoided. It represents huge and systemic failures in the national HIV program that lead to the sacking of the corrupt director a year ago. The gentle tone of the article is wholly inappropriate for Pakistan. They also persist in the ridiculous statement that the epidemic started in Larkana. There is no evidence for this. The Larkana policy broke up a ring to HIV infected drug users who reported went to Karachi about five years ago. Larkana is a remote provincial capital. HIV had been reported in every major city in the country for over a decade. The statement is without fact and misleading.

The piece is still not fit to print but better.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests:

none