Reviewer’s report

Title: UK Internationally recruited nurses from India and the Philippines: the decision to emigrate

Version: 1 Date: 18 December 2008

Reviewer: P Raghuram

Reviewer’s report:

Minor Essential Revisions

1. Although the paper is interesting and well-written, there is some considerable literature from around the world on the multiple factors influencing emigration of nurses. Some WHO and ILO studies have also taken this on board but there are elements of this research which are new. For instance, the difference in motivation between those who migrate directly and those coming via Middle East is interesting. The comparative element is also interesting and more could be done to highlight the innovative elements of this research. They are a bit lost currently.

Moreover, this research may not yet have been incorporated into HR and so the paper should be seen as making an important contributions into the field in which the authors are publishing. I would, therefore, welcome the publication of the paper.

As such the authors may want to think a little more about the original contributions of this paper and strengthen it with a few additional sentences, both in the general context and with reference to the HR literature.

They may also want to explore some of the other studies in the areas in which this paper contributes. For instance, there is a special issue of the Journal of Clinical Nursing 2007 that could be useful in extending some of the arguments made here.

Another interesting line is offered through postcolonial theory. In the paper there is some suggestion that colonial linkages influence mobility - the following references may help to extend that point.


Less relevant (as it is based on the experience of doctors) is my own work: Raghuram, P. (2009 forthcoming) Caring about brain drain migration in a postcolonial world, Geoforum, available online under articles in press.

2. The current analytical base hinges around the notion of the psychological...
contract but I think this is not adequately developed and needs some more thought. Just a few sentences more would be useful.

Discretionary Revisions
1. The difference between 'social' and 'cultural' factors is somewhat unclear. Gender is often seen as a social factor.
2. Gender operates at many levels including the household. For instance, women may migrate because of family pressures. You may want to look at the work of Sheba George on Indian nurses to the US for a very good analysis.
3. Class might be a further issue influencing migration and this could be briefly mentioned.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.