Reviewer's report

Title: Forecasting the absolute and relative shortage of physicians in Japan using a system dynamics model approach

Version: 3 Date: 16 May 2013

Reviewer: Beatriz GL Valcarcel

Reviewer's report:

Major Compulsory Revisions

The authors have not changed the manuscript according to all compulsory points of the first evaluation report.

Specifically, in point 2:

"Assessment of the “need” (2). The number of needed OB/GYN doctors is based on the projected demographics of women by age? Please explain"

The authors may have misunderstood the point, as they change the manuscript to "Moreover, the required physician number by MHLW 2010 did not provide demographics; age,#gender. Therefore, the criterion is not reflected difference between genders. We need to explore quantification methods considering the difference"

All patients of OB/GYN doctors are women, no doubt. My point was if the standards of need defined take into account demographic data to proxy the morbidity and therefore the need of specialists in OB/GYN (fertility rates, incidence of gynecological cancers, for instance). A more detailed explanation of the standards of need should be given in order to justify the model

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

No conflicts of interest