Reviewer's report

Title: Evidence against PALB2 involvement in Icelandic Breast Cancer Susceptibility

Version: 1 Date: 2 May 2008

Reviewer number: 1

Reviewer's report:

1. Major points:

The authors should clarify the reasons why they have chosen to perform a linkage study as opposed to, for example, sequencing of PALB2. The sample size in the linkage study is not very large and would, therefore, not require extensive sequencing efforts. In addition, PALB2 mutations are generally considered to be intermediate penetrance alleles. They have not so far been detected through linkage approaches possibly due to relatively low prevalence and lower risks compared to e.g. BRCA1 or BRCA2.

2. Minor points:

Gene names are not in italics as they should be. This must be corrected.

3. Discretionary Revisions:

The manuscript could be substantially improved by inclusion of some population genetics aspects such as the population history of Iceland. This would also make the paper of more interest to people who are not from Iceland. It is understandable to want to make the paper brief but the genetics perspective should not be ignored.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.