Reviewer's report

Title: False rumours of disease outbreaks caused by infectious myonecrosis virus (IMNV) in the whiteleg shrimp in Asia

Version: 1 Date: 7 May 2011

Reviewer number: 1

Reviewer's report:

In this manuscript, the authors conclude that the rumors about IMNV disease outbreaks since 2006 in Asian countries other than Indonesia are false. To arrive at this conclusion, the authors used two different methods to test the shrimp samples from various Asian countries since 2006. All shrimp samples, except for samples from Indonesia, yielded negative results. This finding was also supported by the lack of official reports of IMNV disease in those countries. Lastly, based on observations of tissue sections, the authors proposed that most of the suspected IMNV outbreaks in Asia are in fact caused by muscle cramp syndrome. Overall, the aim of this manuscript is simple and clear, and the data sufficiently support the authors' conclusion. I see no reason not to recommend the acceptance of this manuscript.

Specific comments:

1. On page 3, lines 68-69: "This strongly indicated that the source of the virus for the outbreak was living shrimp imported from Brazil, probably as broodstock for PL production." Is there any additional, external evidence in support of this?

2. How were the samples tested in this study preserved during transit from the farms to the laboratory? Is it possible that the negative results were due to improper preservation? Especially for those samples that were shipped long distance and/or stored for a long time.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.