Reviewer’s report

Title: Second-Opinion Stress Tele-Echocardiography for Aged Donor Heart Selection

Version: 1 Date: 13 April 2010

Reviewer: Eugenia Capati

Reviewer’s report:

The issue of this paper is interesting and with relevant implications. Donor shortage is a limiting factor in heart transplantation and Adonhers protocol is a valid answer to the problem. The aim of this study to detect the feasibility of a second-opinion stress tele-echocardiography to minimize technical variability in selection of aged donor heart for heart transplantation is of primary importance in this setting. The methods and technical aspects are fully addressed and adequately discussed by the authors. In the results, the second-opinion answer delay was reported only in the case of transplant protocol: if possible, it could be interesting to know the second-opinion answer delay for the simulation protocol (results of all 30 cases).

About the writings, I have some comments:

page 5, line 1: "were" should be "where"; line 4 transfer"s"; the last 3 lines are repeated twice.

The legend of figure 2, 3, 4 and 6 could benefit from refined language revision. In the legend of figure 3, the authors need to correct “left ventricular hypertrophy > than mild” in “left ventricular hypertrophy < than mild”. The conclusion of this work is pertinent to the initial purpose.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.