Reviewer's report

Title: Relationship between carotid intima-media thickness and coronary angiographic findings: a prospective study

Version: 1 Date: 27 September 2009

Reviewer: Rosa Sicari

Reviewer's report:

In the present study, Coskun et al. correlate carotid IMT with the extent of significant CAD. The methodology is appropriate, the results are sound and consistent with a large body of evidence. However, the present study has several limitations that authors should address.

1. The correlation of carotid IMT and extent of CAD is a self-fulfilling prophecy in the present study. The analysis is retrospective and the patients underwent first coronary angiography and then carotid IMT. This approach weakens significantly the present results even though it reinforces what is already perfectly known that atherosclerosis is a multi-site disease and that carotid arteries are an easy and available window on the disease.

2. The study is single-center: No data on inter and intra-reader variability is provided. This is a critical point of the study. Moreover, authors are not using an automatic system of IMT detection. Please address.

3. The discussion is unfocused since it is mostly related to the prognostic impact of carotid IMT whereas authors are addressing its diagnostic impact. In this context, carotid IMT is less powerful and does not allow to detect significant CAD. In other words, no physician would send a patient to coronary angiography on the basis of carotid IMT. Its clinical role is therefore restricted to risk assessment along with other surrogate markers. Please discuss.

4. The conclusions should be toned down. The indication of coronary angiography on the basis of carotid IMT would increase the number of inappropriate studies.

Minor

Figures and sample cases should ne uploaded.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:
'I declare that I have no competing interests'