Reviewer's report

Title: Clinical Utility of Genetic Tests for Inherited Hypertrophic and Dilated Cardiomyopathies

Version: 1 Date: 16 November 2008

Reviewer: Rosa Sicari

Reviewer's report:

This is a well written review addressing the potential role of genetic testing in cardiomyopathies (HCM and DCM) in clinical practice. The manuscript is of potential interest for a general cardiology readership provided authors address the following issues:

1. Delete the chapter on concepts and terms of molecular genetics. Some of these concepts are well known also to physicians whereas a glossary with definitions can be added as an appendix to the manuscript.

2. The clinical implications of the study are a little bit too generic. Since authors have a wide experience in dealing with these tests inside the clinical cardiology setting they should provide their view on how, when, why it is appropriate to perform genetic testing on these populations.

3. The flow chart is not very clear (see previous comment)

4. Genetic testing is still a moving target in clinical cardiology and it would be most appropriate to identify subjects at risk. Nonetheless the clinical work-up in these patients remains elusive. Please address.

5. In their conclusions authors state that reassuring patients is a major achievement of genetic testing but at the same time the relationship between risks and overt disease should be other aim of genetic testing. Please address.

6. Authors do stress the need for genetic counseling as an important part of the evaluation of performed by cardiologists. Please clarify their view on how the clinical cardiologist should work in team with the genetist.

Minor comments:

On pg. 5 authors list the potential life-threatening complications of HCM but do not list arrhythmias. Please add.

“presymptomatic” should changed into asymptomatic

In figure 5: delete improvement of clinical management of DCM patients.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable
**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

'I declare that I have no competing interests'