Reviewer's report

Title: A simplified study of trans-mitral Doppler patterns

Version: 1 Date: 8 November 2008

Reviewer: Luna Gargani

Reviewer's report:

This is a very interesting paper, analizing and constructively criticizing current interpretation and assessment of diastolic function.

The hypothesis is intriguing and, although opposing years of high quality, well-established scientific literature, it is clearly explained and methodologically flawless. The Author had already published an article on this issue, meeting the curiosity of many readers.

Anyway, I would underline with more emphasis, that the reported hypothesis follows the Author’s thought. For example, on page 4, since it has not been so widely accepted that TDI has methodological flaws, it should be more correct to write "this Author believe that ...". For the same reason, I would suggest to avoid the sentence "as erroneously done in some literature".

Independently on what one may think of this new approach and interpretation of Doppler filling patterns, the paper has the merit of underlining a very complex and not completely understood phenomenon, which deserves more investigation.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.