Reviewer’s report

Title: Is there a role of statins in the prevention of aortic biological prostheses degeneration?

Version: 1 Date: 15 December 2005

Reviewer: Rosa Sicari

Reviewer’s report:

General
In the present manuscript Antonini-Canterin et al. address the interesting issue of the role of statins in the prevention of aortic biological prostheses degeneration. The issue is of high clinical interest and still remains very controversial also in the light of very recent published data. Nonetheless the manuscript has major limitations that authors should address.

1. Authors should present their data in a more conventional way, following the rules of the journal.
2. In the introduction it would be important to discuss the manuscript by Cowell et al published on NEJM and referenced as #15 in the manuscript.
3. Due to the retrospective nature of their data, the statistical methodology used should be clarified in detail as well as patient selection criteria. This is a critical issue in order to avoid a potential effect of chance on their data.
4. Patients characteristics should be reported in table form.
5. In the results section authors might improve their manuscript by providing a meta-analysis of the published studies on the effect of statin therapy and aortic stenosis.
6. Images of progressively dysfunctioning prostheses would enrich the manuscript.
7. The protocol proposed by SIEC (ASSIST) should be detailed in particular in the light of Cowell et al. results that do not provide support to their initial hypothesis.

-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'