Reviewer's report

Title: Dynamic 3D echocardiography in virtual reality.

Version: 1 Date: 11 October 2005

Reviewer: Alessandro Salustri

Reviewer's report:

General
This is an interesting manuscript dealing with an application of 3-D echocardiographic images rendered in a holographic format for a virtual reality application. The major strength of the manuscript is the potential applicability for teaching and confident interpretation of the cardiac images.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)
The Authors presented 3-D echocardiographic datasets with normal or pathological mitral valves to 10 observers with different expertise. The Authors might wish to address the following points:
1. How were the observers instructed to assess mitral valve anatomy/pathology and function?
2. How was defined the correct assessment of the normal and pathological mitral valve? There was any standardized criteria of interpretation that the Authors used as references?
2. Was there any differences in the correct interpretation among the different expertise of the observers?

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)
An additional movie depicting one of the findings reported in the results could be highly desired.

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Declaration of competing interests:
'I declare that I have no competing interests'