Reviewer’s report

Title: Meteorologically estimated exposure but not distance predicts asthma symptoms in schoolchildren in the environs of a petrochemical refinery

Version: 1 Date: 16 February 2009

Reviewer: Fernando A Wichmann

Reviewer’s report:

This paper provides an interesting report on environmental exposure in a city in South Africa, and shows that meteorologically exposure but not distance predicts asthma symptoms in schoolchildren near petrochemical refinery.

Although the study was well performed and is consistent in itself, there are a few issues that require further attention, as follows:

Discretionary Revisions
1. In the Abstract the background is not clear and in results, can you include more data? For example how much sympoms, etc.
2. Discussion: What was the definition of “Proximity to a busy road” A standard definition is living within 50 meters of a busy highway, but this is not specified.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

'I declare that I have no competing interests'