Reviewer's report

Title: Urogenital Abnormalities in Men Exposed to Diethylstilbestrol in Utero: A Cohort Study

Version: 1 Date: 16 May 2009

Reviewer: Stanley Robboy

Reviewer's report:

This informative and well written paper analyzes the possible association between intra-uterine exposure to diethylstilbestrol (DES) in men and urogenital abnormalities, based on three U.S. cohorts. This is a controversial issue, and this study, based on a large population, yielded pertinent results and explains previous inconsistent findings.

Minor/discretionary comments:

1. In page 7 the paragraph beginning at “The RRs for exposure before 11th week” (line 4), and ending at “infection/inflammation of the testes” (line 7) is redundant and should be omitted, as these results are clearly shown in Table 2.

2. In the end of the results section, the authors should elaborate on the data of the 20 patients from the Mayo Clinic study who have cumulative dose information. They state that the cumulative dose was 5 grams or higher for only one case of cryptorchidism and one case of epididymal cyst; what are the data for the rest of these 20 patients?

3. On page 10 the authors state that the association between DES and inflammation/infection of the testes may be incidental, since they do not have a hypothesis to this finding. As this finding is statistically significant, the authors might wish to speculate on a possible assumption, e.g., minimal structural abnormalities, presumably minor obstructions, which may be associated with DES exposure, could explain this association.

Level of interest: An article of outstanding merit and interest in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.