Reviewer's report

Title: Respiratory symptoms in children living near busy roads and their relationship to car and truck traffic: Results of an Italian multicenter study (SIDRIA 2)

Version: 3 Date: 15 December 2008

Reviewer: Bert Brunekreef

Reviewer's report:

The main question is answered, but not adequately, and not in the re-submitted paper itself but in another manuscript which was added confidentially but not technically submitted! My inclination is to ask the authors to turn this whole thing inside out: the original paper is not very original, whereas the non-submitted manuscript has at least the potential to address the response bias question in a fair amount of detail. But to bring out that message (which is original), the paper which was not technically submitted needs to be redone completely.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests: ‘I declare that I have no competing interests’