Reviewer’s report

Title: Mitigation of asthma triggers in indoor air: An inter-comparison of ventilation/filtration options for residences

Version: 2 Date: 25 April 2008

Reviewer: Jonathan A Bernstein

Reviewer’s report:

This is a very complicated technical modeling study. There is no real time data to support the author’s conclusions which is a major limitation of this study. The authors do account for a number of variables consistently throughout their modeling but the analysis heavily depends on many assumptions. I am also concerned that the study was funded by TRANE and the conclusions just happen to indicate the central HVAC system functions superiorly compared to stand alone units.

I recommend that a building engineer with expertise in filtration and ventilation review the analyses to determine whether they are sound. I feel that this model if it proves to be sound, could be used as a prototype to analyze ventilation/filtration devices in the home and workplace to predict their value at improving indoor air quality.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:

I have no competing interests.