Reviewer’s report

Title: The Effect of Ambient Air Pollution on Respiratory Health of School Children: a Panel Study

Version: 2  Date: 7 November 2007

Reviewer: Russell Lopez

Reviewer’s report:

General

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

The total sample is still not well characterized. How many students were not included in the study?

It still needs a better discussion of generalizability.

Still needs a better discussion of EBC, though the discussion session says it is not appropriate for this kind of research.

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Unable to decide on acceptance or rejection until the authors have responded to the major compulsory revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.