Author's response to reviews

Title: The Bhopal Disaster and its Aftermath

Authors:

Edward I Broughton (eib6@columbia.edu)

Version: 4 Date: 23 April 2005

Author's response to reviews:

.....

still quite a few typos

PROOFREAD AND CORRECTED TYPOS

Specific items:

Page 4: "The local government was reticent to place heavy industrial safety and pollution control burdens on the struggling industry because it feared the economic effects of the loss of such a large employer[3]."

Does this mean that the local government was aware of the problems and would have liked to force them to improve conditions?

YES. CHANGE MADE.

Page 8: "At every turn, UCC has attempted to withhold finances and manipulate, obfuscate and withhold scientific data to the detriment of victims. An important course of treatment was withheld from MIC victims at UCC's insistence, because it would have been a marker of the nature of the exposure. Even to this date, the company has not stated exactly what was in the toxic cloud that enveloped the city on that December night[8]."

The common understanding is that it was all MIC. This is an interesting, important, but little understood point and needs a bit more detail and elaboration. [Editor's comment: I agree that this is an important point that could use a bit more comment. Few in the country are aware of the HCN controversy and it would be valuable to bring it to the attention of English speaking readers (my understanding is that a lot of this is in Hindi)]

HCN DISCUSSED AND REFERENCES ADDED.

Page 10: "Since abatement efforts consume a large portion of India's GDP, MoEF faces an uphill battle as it tries to fulfill its mandate of reducing industrial pollution[19]." What kind of abatement efforts, what portion of GDP? Sounds like there's quite an interesting debate going on here, but no details.

MORE DETAILS AND TWO MORE EXAMPLES GIVEN

Page 11: "India has relaxed its controls on foreign investment in order to accede to WTO rules and thereby attract a growing flow of capital. In the process, a number of environmental regulations are being rolled back as growing foreign investments continue to roll in."

For example,....

EXAMPLES DISCUSSED IN TEXT.

"The exploitation and export of natural resources has accelerated. Prohibitions against locating industrial
facilities in ecologically sensitive zones have been eliminated while conservation zones are being stripped of their status so that pesticide, cement and bauxite mines can be built[23].

Are you talking about India in this sentence or "a number of developing countries?"

CHANGED SENTENCE FOR CLARIFICATION.

Page 14: "Some moves by the Indian government, including the formation of the MoEF, have served to offer some protection of the public's health from the harmful practices of local and multinational heavy industry but it has mostly been grassroots organizations that have led the charge against the perils of development."

Have you discussed the activities of grassroots organizations, vs the state? Again, an interesting observation that requires more examples.

EXAMPLE OF DUPONT IN GOA GIVEN. MODIFICATION TO PARAGRAPH (AND IN CONCLUSION) MADE.