Reviewer's report

Title: Particulate matter air pollution and respiratory symptoms in individuals having either asthma or chronic obstructive pulmonary disease: a European multicentre panel study

Version: 2 Date: 11 July 2012

Reviewer: Ute Kraus

Reviewer's report:

I appreciate the effort of the authors to improve their manuscript. In large part they followed the reviewer comments satisfying. However, I still have some recommendations that needed to be addressed.

(1) Major compulsory revisions:

(1.1) Missing values:

It is still nothing known about missing values of air pollution measures. I interpret your comment “missing values were excluded from the analysis” that there were missing values and that they were not replaced (e.g. by imputation, averaging the value from the day before and after) . Please include one sentence in your “Air pollution exposure” section on this issue.

Furthermore, to include only the measurement period in Table 3 does not provide information on the number of missing values. Therefore, I explicitly recommend to include the real number of successful measurement days.

(1.2) Statistical analyses:

The description of the meta-analysis is still missing. Just to include a reference [26] is not sufficient. At least you should state if you used a random or fixed effects pooling.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.