Reviewer's report

**Title:** Particulate matter air pollution and respiratory symptoms in individuals having either asthma or chronic obstructive pulmonary disease: a European multicentre panel study

**Version:** 2  **Date:** 16 July 2012

**Reviewer:** Josep Maria Antó

**Reviewer's report:**

don’t think the authors have addressed sufficiently the major problems as indicated in my previous report. In particular with the stratification by asthma, in page 15, lines 11-13, authors say that “…PM10 was significantly associated with ….” But they omit to say that none of the associations was significant for asthma. In page 16, lines 5-8, authors say that “most of the above-mentioned positive associations with PM remained after restricting the analysis to the asthmatic only…” but in table 4, for Lag 1, this is only true for shortness of breath while for the remaining symptoms one can see substantial reductions in the OR. In pag 20 the problem of multiple testing is basically dismissed instead of recognizing that the small sample size do not allow to correct for multiple comparisons. In overall I still think that the study is severely limited by mixing asthma and COPD patients in the same pool and its limited sample size which does not allow to separate the two groups.

**Level of interest:** An article of limited interest

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**

No competing interests