Reviewer's report

Title: Effects of Protein-Enriched Meal in a Weight Loss Program on Liver, Kidney or Bone: a Randomized Controlled Trial

Version: 1 Date: 20 April 2010

Reviewer: Frank f Greenway

Reviewer's report:

General Comments
1. This study evaluated liver, renal and bone safety of a high and normal protein diet. In addition to the standard blood tests, it might have been possible to look at more sensitive markers of bone turnover.

2. The authors also mention that a higher protein diet is more satiating and gives retention of more lean mass. There was no attempt to measure satiation which could have been done with visual analog scales and body impedance might have given have been evaluated with Body Impedence analysis. I mention this in case these things were done, the inclusion of their results would be helpful.

3. The authors state that the high protein diet would be expected to give superior weight loss and weight maintenance. That was not seen in this study. It makes one wonder if the study might have been underpowered to show the expected results. It would strengthen the paper in this reviewer's opinion, if that possibility were addressed in the discussion.

Specific Comments
1. Page 3 last line in paragraph 2. I believe that the study to which you refer (9) is over 4 years rather than 5 as the sentence suggests.

2. Page 7 third line under "weight loss": I believe "amount" should be "amounts".

3. I question the need for a graph on BMI when you show a weight graph that demonstrates much the same information.

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.