Author's response to reviews

Title: Changing perceptions of hunger on a high nutrient density diet

Authors:

Joel Fuhrman (drfuhrman@drfuhrman.com)
Barbara Sarter (bsarter@sandiego.edu)
Dale Glaser (glaserconsult@sbcglobal.net)
Acocella Steve (SAcocella@aol.com)

Version: 5 Date: 27 August 2010

Author's response to reviews:

We are submitting the revised version of our manuscript, which addresses each of the points raised by each of the reviewers. Unfortunately, I accepted all the changes in the document so they cannot be highlighted now, but below I am detailing every change that we did:

Reviewer Barnard:
1. Para 1: We described in concrete numbers the volume of patients seen in the practice for the past twenty years.
2. Para 2: lines 18 and 20. We have provided additional citations to support our contention.
3. Para 3: We moved the referral to the Canadian study back to the Discussion section of the manuscript. Additional citations to support our hypothesis of the addictive nature of the Western diet are provided. This paragraph was edited and polished to make the language more readable.
4. Para 4: line 47, we specify the exact number of participants who completed at least some of the survey questions. Line 49, we added the total number of website subscribers who were invited to participate.
5. Lines 78-84: We explain why we felt the need to develop and use our own survey.
6. Limitations of the study, lines 289-304
   a. We acknowledge that we did not assess the actual previous dietary patterns of the participants.
   b. We acknowledge that we did not assess other than through self-report actual adherence to the HND.
   c. We acknowledge that participants were self-selected and discuss the possibility that they gave answers that they knew the researchers would be looking for. However, we explain that they were assured of the anonymity of their answers; emails were not stored with their responses.
   d. We explain that participants were blocked from multiple submissions of the
survey.

7. Lines 223-246

   a. We provide additional citations to support our hypothesis that toxic metabolites from high fat, high sugar foods contribute to withdrawal symptoms experienced as hunger when their digestion is complete.

Lines 247-264

Additional citations are provided to support our contention that overweight people experience an addiction syndrome.

Lines 265-76

This paragraph was moved from the introductory section and edited.

Throughout the manuscript:

   We changed the descriptor for the participants’ previous diet from Standard American Diet to Previous Usual Diet.

Competing interests:

   We inform you of Dr. Fuhrman’s potential competing interest.

Reviewer Greger comments:

   1. Competing interests have been acknowledged.

   2-7. 9-12:

   All non-essential minor revisions suggested were adopted. We provided substantial additional citations where requested and executed all suggested editing.

   8 The citation is correct and we were able to access the article. Not sure what the problem was that Dr. Greger had.

   13 We clarified that on line 262, the citation discussed referred to an animal study.

   14 Limitations were further discussed as noted above.

Discretionary revisions:

Page 13: we discussed why the results in the various studies discussed were inconsistent.

   We replaced the old reference 24 with the one suggested and added several other pertinent citations.

   All typos were corrected.

Dr. Wertheimer did not make any suggestions beyond what was suggested by the other reviewers.

   Thanks for your consideration of this manuscript. We are very pleased with the revisions and are grateful for the excellent suggestions offered by the review process!

Sincerely,