Reviewer’s report

Title: Dietary intakes and food sources of fatty acids in diets of Guatemalan schoolchildren: A cross-sectional study

Version: 3 Date: 20 October 2009

Reviewer: Kiyonori Kuriki

Reviewer’s report:

Dear authors,

Thank you very much for revising the manuscript.

Comment for responses 1 and 6
In general, a cross-sectional study is defined as follows; both risk factor(s) and disease are ascertained at the same time (reference: Mausner JS and Bahn S, Epidemiology: an introductory text, WB Saunders company, 1985). In this study, however, dietary intakes of fat and fatty acids were defined as risk factors for diseases, but any surrogate markers for diseases, such as percentages of children with overweight and/or obese, and higher levels of serum lipids, were not shown. Their intakes and the sources were merely summarized sorted by gender and socioeconomic status (SES), and the findings, therefore, were not conducted by a cross-sectional study. To facilitate understanding by readers in this journal, this reviewer strongly proposes to show associations between their intakes and some surrogate markers for diseases. If impossible, this reviewer strongly suggests that this report should be summarized as Note, but not Original article. Including this findings, instead, the authors may have a chance to sum up time trends of their intakes and health conditions such as overweight, obese and diabetes in Guatemalan children, as a descriptive epidemiology.

Comment for response 4
The sentences were overstated because the values of the authors and WHO were not systematically evaluated by the same method.

Comment for response 6
To facilitate understanding by readers in this journal, the following information should be kindly introduced in the text; 1) characteristics of this study subjects (ie., height, weight, BMI, and so on), and 2) results from validity and reliability tests for fat and fatty acid intakes (even if the references were quoted).

Minor comment
1. ALA is not defined in Abstract.
2. Values for a vertical axis in girls, Fig 3B, were appropriately not shown.
3. To reduce the pages, all of figures should be summarized in one table.
Level of interest: Reject as not of sufficient priority to merit publishing in this journal

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.