Reviewer's report

Title: Effect of octanoic acid-rich formula on plasma ghrelin levels in cachectic patients with chronic respiratory disease

Version: 1 Date: 8 April 2009

Reviewer: Hiroshi H Mukae

Reviewer's report:

- Major Compulsory Revisions

My comments;

This article is very interesting because this was written about the relation between octanotic acid-rich formula and plasma ghrelin in cachectic patients with chronic respiratory disease.

Most of patients with chronic respiratory disease have nutrition problem and are prone to become emaciated. So I think that this article can be a fundamental study and be one of the reasons for administration of octanoic acid-rich formula for cachectic patients with chronic respiratory disease.

But I have some questions about this article. Please answer to the questions.

Method;

1) How did you decide the definition of “Cachectic patients”? Some papers used “weight loss >10% of previous normal weight”. I think you’d better describe the grounds for cachectic patients.

2) What kind of underlying diseases did the recruited patients have?

3) How did you deal with diabetes mellitus or glucose intolerance in this study?

Study Protocol;

1) You decided 1800 Kcal/day for the daily intake calorie on Day 1 and Day 2. But I think that the key is how much their appetite or intake calorie is increased with the formula.

2) What is the number of the patients with the formula and without the formula in “the first trial”? Did you divide four in-patients into two groups (with and without the formula)? Or did you check the data for four in-patients under each condition (with or without the formula)?

Figure and Table

1) Figure 1 -à Figure

2) You’d better add the X-axis and Y-axis’s title.

3) Did you have the significant difference between groups with and without the formula?
4) Were there any relationships between acyl-ghrelin levels (or rate) and growth rate in other parameters after administration of formula?

Others;
Orexygenic -à Orexigenic ?

**Level of interest:** An article of importance in its field

**Quality of written English:** Needs some language corrections before being published

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

**Declaration of competing interests:**
I declare that I have no competing interests