Reviewer’s report

Title: Vitamin E supplementation and pneumonia risk in males who initiated smoking at an early age: effect modification by body weight and dietary vitamin C

Version: 2 Date: 26 October 2008

Reviewer: Susan M. Graham

Reviewer’s report:

Major Compulsory Revisions:
None. The authors’ approach to presenting adjusted results for the small subgroup analyses seems reasonable, and the revisions to the introduction section more clearly present the rationale and design of the analysis performed.

Minor Compulsory Revisions:
None

Discretionary Revisions:
I understand it would be complicated to include confidence intervals for two groups in the same graph, so that seems unnecessary. My other point about the number at risk in each group may not have been clear, but had to do with any differences in the follow-up time. The figures for cumulative hazard go to month 8, which is two months after the median follow-up time in this study. It might be informative to know how many participants were still in follow-up in each group at the points where the divergence of curves becomes most marked. This could be done by including the number at risk (and cumulative events per group, if desired) for each group under the survival curves. This would be a most important if there was differential loss to follow-up by group for some reason.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.