Reviewer's report

Title: An increase of cereal intake as an approach to weight reduction in children is effective only when accompanied by nutrition education: a randomized controlled trial

Version: 1 Date: 3 June 2008

Reviewer: Isabelle Aeberli

Reviewer's report:

Reviewers report on the manuscript:

An increase of cereal intake as an approach to weight reduction in children is effective only when accompanied by nutrition education: a randomized controlled trial

The presented study evaluates the effect of the intake of ready to eat cereals as well as nutrition education on weight and blood lipids in overweight children in Mexico.

General comment:

The study seems to be carefully planned and carried out and has been able to show some interesting results.

Discretionary revisions

Specific comments:

1. In the results section on page 8 line 1 a figure 1 is mentioned, but I could not find any figures in the manuscript.

2. The aim of inducing RTEC in the diet was to reduce fat content and energy density of the whole diet. It would be interesting to see the actual changes in each diet and to compare the differences in the composition and not only the anthropometric and metabolic changes. Was any kind of dietary assessment carried out during the study?

For example on page 10 line 10 you state that carbohydrate consumption has been increased in your study, but you don’t say anything about the actual composition of the diet.

3. As you mention in the last paragraph of the discussion (page 11, line 1), you have not included a group receiving the nutrition education alone and can therefore not be sure, that the consumption of RTEC has had any effect at all. This would have been a really interesting point to consider. As there seems to be no differences between the groups receiving one or two servings of RTEC and also no difference between those and the control one might come to the conclusion, that it is indeed only the education which makes a difference.

4. One of the aims of the study was also to increase between meals satiety by
increasing the consumption of carbohydrates. I was wondering if the choice of cereals (they seem to be made from refined flour and not to contain a lot of fibers) was ideal. Several studies have shown increasing satiety after the consumption of fiber rich foods and of foods with a low glycemic index. I wonder if by choosing less refined products the results might not have bee different.

**Level of interest:** An article of importance in its field

**Quality of written English:** Acceptable

**Statistical review:** No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.