Reviewer's report

Title: Serum lipid responses to psyllium fiber: differences between pre- and post-menopausal, hypercholesterolemic women

Version: 3 Date: 21 July 2008

Reviewer: Alexander Edionwe

Reviewer's report:

Minor Essential Revisions

1. The number of subjects may not be enough to detect true significance. It is my opinion that there is need for sample size estimation that will allow for the determination of numbers of subjects required for a study such as this. This point was earlier addressed by the authors in their response to previous reviewer.

2. In addition, nuts (eg, almonds), viscous fibers (eg, fibers from oats, apple and barley), soy proteins, and plant sterols, reduce serum lipids. How much of these did subjects incorporate as part of their daily habitual diet intakes? What was done to assess individual pattern of intake in order to avoid complication of extra fiber from unintended sources? Points could be clarified

3. Clinical trials also showed that psyllium helps to lower LDL cholesterol when taken with a low-fat diet, more than a low-fat diet alone. Because of this, the US Food and Drug Administration (FDA) allows marketers to claim that using psyllium along with a low-fat diet may reduce risk of heart disease. Thus, knowing the level of fat intake of subjects may enhance the design of this study.

This trial, has merit and the questions raised above could be included in a follow up research which I believe is the purpose of the pilot study.

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable