Reviewer's report

Title: "Changes in energy expenditure associated with ingestion of high protein, high fat versus high protein, low fat meals among underweight, normal weight, and overweight females."

Version: 3 Date: 23 August 2007

Reviewer: Rick Weissinger

Reviewer's report:

General

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct) Please insert a reference after the sentence "Metabolic rate may increase up to about 30% after protein consumption" on page 3. Please also reference the sentence "Yet, while high protein diets provide good satiety" also on page 3. Consider adding references of studies that indicate higher mortality in persons following high protein high fat diets (there are 2 or 3 published) for that same section. On page 10, line 7, remove "Like" and consider using "As in the studies by __ and ___,..."

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article whose findings are important to those with closely related research interests

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.