Reviewer's report

Title: BMI, Percent Body Fat, and Regional Body Fat Distribution in Relation to Leptin Concentrations in Healthy, Non-Smoking Postmenopausal Women in a Feeding Study

Version: 1 Date: 21 November 2006

Reviewer: Costantino Di Carlo

Reviewer's report:

General
In this study, the authors aimed at examine the association between serum leptin concentrations and adiposity estimated by BMI and dual energy x-ray absorptiometry measures in postmenopausal women. They found that, under controlled dietary conditions, higher levels of adiposity were associated with higher concentrations of serum leptin. The study, although limited by its design, is well designed and performed. We feel that its usefulness is very limited, since it adds very limited informations to the body of knowledge on postmenopausal body composition and leptin levels. The authors state that their study is the first to report the associations between DEXA body fat distribution and lean body mass in relation to serum leptin concentrations in which energy was balanced to maintain weight of the women. They do not take into consideration the work of other authors (Di Carlo et al., 2004, Tommaselli et al., 2006), that, although did not use a particular diet, studied women that did not increase their weight. The results of this study simply confirm the enormous amount of data present in the literature

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Reject as not of sufficient priority to merit publishing in this journal

Level of interest: An article of limited interest

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.