Reviewer's report

Title: Soy protein supplementation does not cause lymphocytopenia in postmenopausal women

Version: Date: 13 December 2005

Reviewer: Shao-Yi Cheng

Reviewer's report:

General
It is a well designed Randomized controlled study; however, there are some points needed to be clarified.

Major Compulsory Revisions (that the author must respond to before a decision on publication can be reached)

1. How do you subjectively measure the compliance of the participants? Is there any blood drawn showing the level of genistein?

2. Blood collection was only performed twice at the beginning and end of the study, which can hardly show the trend and curve of the hematological changes of the participants.

3. There was high drop out rate (25/87), which will definitely affect the power of the study.

Minor Essential Revisions (such as missing labels on figures, or the wrong use of a term, which the author can be trusted to correct)

1. Need more detailed description of inclusion and exclusion criteria of the study.


3. To be more specific, the title should be modified into “60 mg soy isoflavone supplementation does not cause lymphocytopenia in postmenopausal women”

4. In “Conclusion”, it should be stated that “60 mg soy isoflavone does not……”

Discretionary Revisions (which the author can choose to ignore)

What next?: Accept after minor essential revisions

Level of interest: An article of importance in its field

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, and I have assessed the statistics in my report.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.