Reviewer's report

Title: Effects of higher protein vs. higher fat snacks on appetite control, satiety, and eating initiation in healthy women

Version: 2
Date: 3 September 2014
Reviewer: Daniel Crabtree

Reviewer's report:

Minor essential revisions:

Background:
The background is very brief and requires more information. The opening paragraph could then be followed by a paragraph describing research that has examined the impact of snack composition on appetite control. The authors could also emphasize the effects that protein intake has on appetite. Adding this information will make the background to this study clearer for the reader.

Discussion:
The discussion should include a limitations section. The limitations should include reference to the absence of hormone measures in the present study. The authors offer only one broad suggestion for future research in the discussion. The authors should offer more potential research ideas for the future, including the study of overweight/obese men, women and children.

Abstract:
Paragraph 1: “nutrient poor high fat snacks.” Should be “high-fat”

Methods:
Paragraph 3: Where volunteers excluded if they were taking certain types of medication?
Paragraph 4: How were the participants acclimated to the different snacks?
Paragraph 4: Volunteers were given 236ml of water with their snack. This is very specific. Why this exact volume?
Paragraph 4: Volunteers were offered pizza pockets for dinner. Were volunteers asked before their participation in the study if they liked pizza pockets?
Paragraph 5: Remove the statement regarding statistical trends. It is not necessary to state this.

Results:
Paragraph 6: “and increases in fullness…” insert a comma after “fullness” to break up the sentence.
Discussion:
Paragraph 10&11: The authors should consider merging these two paragraphs to help the flow of the discussion.
Paragraph 11: “Additionally, eating initiation…” replace “Additionally” with “However”.
Paragraph 11: When referring to previous studies, the authors should state what populations these studies examined, i.e. men/women, lean/overweight?

Conclusion:
Break the concluding sentence into two sentences. Replace the comma after “specifically high-fat crackers and chocolate,..” with a full stop. “suggesting that a nutrient-rich,” replace “suggesting” with “This finding suggests” to begin a new sentence.

Figure 1&2:
Legends should be underneath figures.

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests.