Reviewer’s report

Title: Poor ability to resist tempting calorie rich food is linked to altered balance between neural systems involved in urge and self-control

Version: 3 Date: 19 August 2014

Reviewer: Daniel Crabtree

Reviewer’s report:

Following the revisions made by the authors in response to the reviewers comments, this article has been very much improved. The results are now much clearer and, importantly, the limitations of the study have been explained in detail. I still believe that there are methodological issues related to the study itself (i.e. the time of day the scans were conducted and the lack of pre-scan dietary control measures), however the authors have responded to these comments effectively.

I only have one minor comment:

I would recommend removing the statement in the limitations relating to the need for a study examining differences in neural responses to food following standardized meals vs normal meals, as I do not think this study would be of interest. Both of these methods are acceptable, however the researcher must choose which is most appropriate for their own study. In the case of the present study, the time that meals were consumed prior to the scans was the main issue, along with the type of meal, breakfast vs lunch.

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests.