Reviewer's report

Title: Effects of L-carnitine supplementation on oxidative stress and antioxidant enzymes activities in patients with coronary artery disease: a randomized, placebo-controlled trial

Version: 3 Date: 17 July 2014

Reviewer: Mark F McCarty

Reviewer's report:


In my judgement, this is nearly ready for publication. The authors do not seem to have grasped the first suggestion of my initial review. I suggest that lines 17-19 of their abstract be revised as follows:

The plasma levels of LC and malondialdehyde, and erythrocyte antioxidant activities [catalase (CAT), superoxide disumutase (SOD), glutathione peroxidase (GPx)], were measured before and after intervention.

It's important to explain to the reader where these parameters were measured.

Aside from this modest change, I think that the authors have adequately addressed the comments of the referees, including mine. Their study is straightforward, and the results merit publication.

I would however like to comment on the concern raised by one of the reviewers regarding the claim that L-carnitine may be pro-atherogenic. A recent invited commentary in Mayo Clinic Proceedings clarifies that there is no good reason to suspect that, within the dose range used clinically, L-carnitine would promote atherosclerosis or otherwise compromise cardiovascular health. To the contrary, there is ample reason to conclude that carnitine is protective for vascular health. I append this commentary in case the concerned reviewer or the authors of the current manuscript might wish to read it.