Reviewer’s report

Title: Effect of supplementation with ferrous sulfate or iron bis-glycinate chelate on ferritin concentration in Mexican schoolchildren: a randomized controlled trial

Version: 1 Date: 19 March 2014

Reviewer: Amina Khambalia

Reviewer’s report:

Major Compulsory Revisions

1. Discuss whether any strategies were employed to prevent contamination.
2. What was the a priori sample size, if any?
3. Was compliance measured and if so, how?
4. Is it possible that diet in boarding schools is fairly constant among study participants and differences in the types of iron compounds may have had a greater effect difference if children were consuming different diets?
5. Discussion does not address the broader implications and clinical relevance clearly. What conditions favour selection of one treatment over the other, such as resources, costs, availability, etc. Are both of these types of supplements readily available for use and which is more commonly used? Will these results change practice? Would choice over one or the other be affected by real-life conditions that were controlled for in this study, such as infection?

Minor Essential Revisions

1. Page 15 of Discussion provides paragraph on studies on iron supplementation that focus on children with IDA - the relevance of this lit review is not clear in the Discussion. The authors need to contextualise how this information relates to interpreting their study findings.

Quality of written English: Needs some language corrections before being published

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:

I declare that I have no competing interests