Reviewer’s report

Title: An Anti-Inflammatory Diet as Treatment for Inflammatory Bowel Disease: A Case Series

Version: 4  Date: 9 December 2013

Reviewer: Takayuki Yamamoto

Reviewer’s report:

This retrospective study was to evaluate the efficacy of the Anti-Inflammatory Diet (IBD-AID) in patients with inflammatory bowel disease (IBD). Medical records of 11 patients treated with this diet therapy were reviewed. The Harvey Bradshaw Index (HBI) for Crohn’s disease (CD) and Modified Truelove and Witts Severity Index (MTLWSI) for ulcerative colitis (UC) before and after the diet therapy were assessed.

Major Compulsory Revisions
1. Although the authors have already discussed, the sample size was clearly too small to rigorously evaluate the efficacy of the diet therapy. Only 8 CD patients and 3 UC patients were investigated. Why were both CD and UC patients included?
2. The location of CD (upper gastrointestinal/small bowel/colon/ileocolon) and behavior of CD (inflammatory/structuring/penetrating) were not presented. What are indications for this diet therapy? e.g., small bowel disease, inflammatory behavior.
3. Patients with various types of medical treatment were included: 5-aminosalycylic acids, immunomodulators, steroids, biologics, or elemental diet. What is the impact of these medical therapies on the efficacy of the IBD-AID?
4. In this retrospective study, the HBI and MTLWSI scores were available at the appropriate time before and after the diet therapy?
5. In this study, endoscopic assessment before and after the treatment was not conducted. This should have been conducted in addition to clinical assessment.
6. Further, fecal markers (e.g., calprotectin) and gut flora were not evaluated. Objective assessment with these markers will strengthen the findings obtained in this study.
7. As the authors stated in the discussion session, a large randomized controlled study with evaluation of objective markers is necessary to draw their conclusions.

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests