Reviewer's report

Title: The Role of Meal Viscosity and oat beta-glucan Characteristics in Human Appetite Control: A Randomized Crossover Trial

Version: 1 Date: 19 March 2014

Reviewer: Miriam Clegg

Reviewer's report:

This is nice, practical and very thoroughly researched and written paper. My only disappointment with it is that only subjective measures of food intake were taken and food intake itself was not measured.

Major comments

Only subjective measures of food intake were completed. Food intake was not measured although I do think that there is still some merit to the results using just VAS data I think the limitations of this should be commented on in the discussion.

Minor revisions

"To determine the presence of colds or allergies that might affect taste, participants were required to complete a questionnaire and were asked to return on another day if such a condition was present."

Good control but what as this questionnaire? Did you simply sk them or was this a pretest questionnaire

Table 2 - Energy and nutrient content of breakfast meals where does this come from - manufacturers info?

Table 1 – There should be an astericks beside SD

Units of mm need to be given in Figure 1

Discretionary revisions

In the introduction you say "Fiber is a natural product and would likely appeal to consumers due to its association with wholesome foods. " . Alot of the population knows about the benefits of fibre at this stage, it is not something new. Perhaps rephrase this to emphasis that what they do not know is that processing effects it.

Not much is made of the glycaemic load being different or the difference in molecular weight though this can have a big impact on GE which will influence satiety. You might want to look at

Thondre PS1, Shafat A, Clegg ME. Br J Nutr. 2013 Dec;110(12):2173-9. doi:

Molecular weight of barley #-glucan influences energy expenditure, gastric emptying and glycaemic response in human subjects.
Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: Yes, but I do not feel adequately qualified to assess the statistics.

Declaration of competing interests:
I declare that I have no competing interests