Reviewer’s report

Title: Results from the National Health and Nutrition Examination Survey, 2007-2008: High proportions of foods recommended for consumption by the United States Dietary Guidance contain solid fats and added sugar

Version: Date: 3 December 2013

Reviewer: Ute Alexy

Reviewer’s report:

The authors highlight the potential implications of following the food based dietary guidelines in the context of the population’s actual food choices. Although the paper raised an important issue (quantitative food guidelines are not sufficient to ensure adequate dietary intakes), some major and minor concerns remained.

Major compulsory revisions

The result section is meager. The authors only present one small table where column 4 results from the sum of column 1 and 2 minus column 3; and the both last columns amount to 100 % (please skip at least the last one). Some more data are necessary to underpin the main message of the paper, e.g. tertiles of SoF and AS-contents.

The authors present SoFAS contents of all foods reported in their sample regardless if the food has been reported just once or very frequent. It would be interest to know the SoFAS content of for example the 10 most favourite foods of every food group.

Minor essential revisions

Title:

Please rephrase the title with the most important part at the beginning: High proportions of foods recommended for ..... contain added sugar- Results from the .... 2007-2008.

Line 55

Please give a more comprehensive definition of solid fats and added sugars and a reference for the term “empty calories” which is applied to both added sugars and “sold” fat.

Line 64

Please remove the subtitle “Ethic statement”

Results

Please give some food group examples for those readers who are not familiar with the American food grouping system. For example, why is it surprising that
the fats and oils group included 68 % SoF? Only 68 % - why not 100 %? What means solid fat in dairy? Does this include full fat dairy?

Lines 134-135
The authors suggest analyzing other factors of diet quality, e.g. sodium or energy density. I assume, that these data are available in the FNDDS, so what was the reason to include only solid fats and added sugars in the present analysis?

Table 1
Please add a foodnote which explains the term „weighted“ in the title.
What means the “**” which has been placed after beverages?
The first table line repeats the table title at part.

Quality of written English: Acceptable

Statistical review: No, the manuscript does not need to be seen by a statistician.

Declaration of competing interests:
no competing interests